

SVENSKA INSTITUTEN I ATHEN OCH ROM
INSTITUTUM ATHENIENSE ATQUE INSTITUTUM ROMANUM REGNI SUECIAE

Opuscula

Annual of the Swedish Institutes at Athens and Rome

10
2017

STOCKHOLM

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE:

Prof. Gunnel Ekroth, Uppsala, Chairman
Prof. Arne Jönsson, Lund, Vice-chairman
Ms. Kristina Björkstén Jersenius, Stockholm, Treasurer
Dr. Erika Weiberg, Uppsala, Secretary
Prof. Karin Blomqvist, Lund
Prof. Peter M. Fischer, Göteborg
MA Axel Frejman, Uppsala
Dr. Kristian Göransson, Rome
Prof. Arja Karivieri, Stockholm
Dr. Emilie Karlsmo, Uppsala
Prof. Anne-Marie Leander Touati, Lund
Dr. Jenny Wallansten, Athens

EDITOR:

Dr. Petra Pakkanen
Department of Archaeology and Classical Studies
Stockholm University
SE-106 91 Stockholm
editor@ecsi.se

SECRETARY'S ADDRESS:

Department of Archaeology and Ancient History
Uppsala University
Box 626
SE-751 26 Uppsala
secretary@ecsi.se

DISTRIBUTOR:

eddy.se ab
Box 1310
SE-621 24 Visby

For general information, see www.ecsi.se

For subscriptions, prices and delivery, see <http://ecsi.bokorder.se>

Published with the aid of a grant from The Swedish Research Council

The English text was revised by Rebecca Montague, Hindon, Salisbury, UK

Opuscula is a peer reviewed journal. Contributions to *Opuscula* should be sent to the Secretary of the Editorial Committee before 1 November every year. Contributors are requested to include an abstract summarizing the main points and principal conclusions of their article. For style of references to be adopted, see www.ecsi.se/guides-contributors. Books for review should be sent to the Secretary of the Editorial Committee.

ISSN 2000-0898

ISBN 978-91-977798-9-0

© Svenska Institutet i Athen and Svenska Institutet i Rom

Printed by Elanders, Sverige AB, Mölnlycke 2017

Cover illustration from N.-P. Yioutsos in this volume, p. 172

Trendall also gives accounts of many 'Phlyax' vases which depict comic actors and scenes. These images can also be connected to Dionysos since many of the plays were performed in his honour. Representations of tragedy are also discussed here. Some scenes are indicated with inscriptions identifying the characters, yet in others this is possible only through meticulous examination of figures and attributes in a variety of contexts. This task is complex since the figures on the 'tragic scenes' are usually not depicted wearing theatre masks.

Three first chapters in the third section concentrating on regional styles and painters provide a good introduction to the features that characterize the Sicilian style. This style was first recognized and set apart as an autonomous style in the 1950s. This lateness in stylistic observations reflects, I believe, both the difficulties the scholarship has encountered regarding South Italian vase-painting and the practical utility of the classification methods elaborated by Trendall and his colleagues. The discussion regarding the Sicilian Borelli, Lugano and Checker painters as well as the Lentini-Manfria and Borelli groups provides the reader with useful information concerning the recognition of painters and workshops. Two following articles concern the Campanian style, and the Libation Painter, together with a previously unknown painter. Another article concerns the Lucanian style including the Painter of the Berlin Dancing Girl and the Primato Painter. The section ends with three articles on the Apulian style discussing the Felton, Truro and Darius painters.

One of the differences between Trendall's and Beazley's works is that Trendall provided a more thorough description of how to identify traits of different painters' hands. This issue is reflected very well in these articles. Trendall's work is a very useful methodological tool for a student entering the field. Regardless of the critical views within the field, this branch of the ancient studies requires skills which do not in fact differ much from the skills needed when telling apart paintings by the surrealists Joan Miró and Wassily Kandinsky.

The publication ends with indices of collections, painters, and groups, together with a 13-page long list of Trendall's publications spanning a period of over 65 years, from the year 1932 to posthumous publications in 1996 and 1997. Trendall's production encompasses more than 220 published texts of which only a tenth were written in cooperation with others (mostly with the Australians Alexander Cambitoglou and Ian McPhee) – an achievement which will hardly be surpassed.

The book displays a good layout and the placement of the different sections is well thought-out. Both the old references and the new ones added by McPhee are very thorough and the abbreviations are easily located in the list of abbreviations in the beginning of the book. The articles have been chosen with great care and give a very good introduction to the field of South Italian vase-painting as well as to the problems of styles

and attributions. They serve the interests of scholars, students and the general public alike. My only reservation concerns the sizes of the reproductions of the vases; images with the sizes of the original publications would in my opinion better served the purpose. In sum, I believe that this book well merits its place in a book shelf of anyone interested in vase-painting, especially of those preoccupied with vase-painting of Magna Graecia.

PEDRO BENTANCOUR GARIN
Department of Archaeology and Classical Studies
Stockholm University
SE 106 91 Stockholm
pedro.bentancour@antiken.su.se

G. Renberg, *Where dreams may come. Incubation sanctuaries in the Greco-Roman world*, vols. 1–2 (Religions in the Greco-Roman world 184), Leiden & Boston: Brill 2016. 1046 pp. ISBN 978-90-04-29976-4 (hardback set) ISBN 978-90-04-34621-5 (hardback, vol. 1) ISBN 978-90-04-34622-2 (hardback, vol. 2) ISBN 978-90-04-33023-8 (e-book).

Incubation, or the ritualized sleep in a holy place in order to receive a healing or an oracle, has long been subject to scholarly fascination and many previous studies.

The aim of the author is to document (or disprove) all sanctuaries in the Greco-Roman world (including Egypt, and to a certain extent Mesopotamia and the Early Christian world) that have been claimed to be places of incubation. The author carefully evaluates the literary, epigraphical and archaeological evidence for ritual sleep in sanctuaries, making the testimonia available also for non-Classicists.

The book consists of two volumes: one with the text proper, and one with 17 appendices, bibliography and indices.

21 architectural plans and 59 good quality figures clarify the account. The index locorum comprises 47 pages, including museum collections, published Greco-Roman works of art, and textual sources arranged after geographical provenance. This tool is very valuable when looking for specific categories of evidence or if you quickly want to find references for a particular relief or text passage.

The appendices consist of thematic studies, which could not be fitted within the site-by-site survey of the book proper. Here we find catalogues of sites previously but wrongly linked to incubation, other direct oracular techniques which did not involve dreams (e.g. voice oracles), and two very useful illustrated catalogues of incubation reliefs. One or two of the appendices might have been worked into the site-by-site account of the book proper, such as the ones on preparatory

rites (prayer, fasting). Some of the appendices are longer and more argumentative, such as the ones on Libanius and his many visits to Asklepieia, and, especially, the phenomenon of Early Christian incubation.

A distinction is wisely made between therapeutic incubation, where a dream in a sacred place is sought to cure an illness or heal a wound, or indeed to remedy infertility, and divinatory incubation. As the author remarks, the categories intermingle: ill people who incubated at the Plutonium of Acharaka, and worshippers asking Asklepios for lost treasures, demonstrate the variation of the phenomenon. Nonetheless, the specialization of cults into primarily healing ones and divinatory ones is a helpful tool for structuring the evidence.

The book proper (volume one) consists of three parts. The first part entails a short introduction and a chapter on the possible origins of incubation in the Near East and in particular Hittite culture.

Then follows the second part, on incubation in Greek cults. This part is divided into separate chapters on first, Asklepieia, then on other mainly therapeutic incubation cults (Amphiaraios, the Plutonium at Acharaka, Hemitheia at Kastabos), and last, on cults where incubation was seemingly mainly a technique for oracular knowledge (and not healing, such as the early Amphiaraios, Pasiphae at Thalamai, Brizo on Delos, and Amphilochos and Mopsos in Cilicia).

Under each section the testimonia (spanning eight centuries) are divided into archaeological structures at the sanctuaries associated with the sleeping, and then the iconographical, literary and epigraphic sources. Due to the amount of evidence from the cult of Asklepios, this section has also a separate part on the cures and rituals at Asklepieia: how Asklepios cured (directly or through a prescription, how the god was envisaged) and the general structure of the ritual preparation and giving of thanks.

The third and last part of volume one covers Egyptian and Greco-Egyptian cults where incubation was practised. This last part is divided into four chapters, on Sarapis and Isis, Saqqâra and the "House of Osiris-Apis", Amenhotep and Imhotep at Deir el-Bahari and Thebes, and finally, a chapter on other Egyptian cults where incubation was possibly practised. The inclusion of the Egyptian material is a remarkable achievement for a Classicist, and highly relevant for the study of the Greco-Roman world, as syncretistic habits abound in the material presented.

The author is very careful in his evaluation of the testimonia, and is never tempted to draw conclusions too far from the fragmentary material. As for the possible influence of the idea of incubation from the Near East to Greece (pp. 36–73), I would, though, contrary to the author argue that the Mesopotamian and Hittite testimonia point that divination through dreams in a sacred place was primarily performed by

kings, that there is a considerable time-gap before the ritual is first documented in Archaic Greece, and that it was not an institutionalized technique for worshippers in general as it became in Classical Greece. (See A. Mouton, 'Usages privés de l'incubation d'après les textes hittites', *JANER* 3, 2003, 73–91, 75, 87, the interesting inscription about a leather-worker being dubious as to how it should be interpreted: it might be question of a person of special standing in religious contexts, p. 75; cf. Renberg 64–66). Any view on the matter of continuity of course depends upon how incubation is defined and how specific as concerns ritual an influence of the idea of incubation from the East to the West is imagined (A. Zgoll, for instance, in her seminal *Traum und Welterleben im antiken Mesopotamien*, Münster 2006, defines incubation as kingly incubation).

Some theoretical questions such as the supposedly Chthonian nature of Greek incubation are left aside (although initially stating that the ritual was practised in cults of Chthonian deities, since Greek healing sanctuaries were generally associated with male heroes or Chthonian gods, p. 32). Here, future studies are needed on the connection between Asklepios and Apollo, the prime healer in Greece before Asklepios, as well as the Dodona inscriptions, where Zeus is asked for healings (for argumentation that incubation rituals were not Chthonian in character, see Ehrenheim, *Greek incubation rituals in Classical and Hellenistic times*, Liège 2015, 112–116, 151–157).

Since the author includes literary and epigraphical as well as archaeological sources dating from the Bronze Age to late antiquity (even including an appendix on Early Christian incubation), it is difficult, due to the multifaceted nature of the testimonia, to find a unified argument that runs through the book. The map that the author lays out is rich and disparate, of different and varying habits surrounding ritual divinatory sleep in many different sanctuaries and cults across the Mediterranean area, from the Bronze Age to the Early Christian time. The richness of material is coupled with an enthusiastic attention to detail (including, for instance, a new reading of *LSAM* 14 of Pergamon, based on Fränkel's sketch as the inscription was considered lost (pp. 196–197). I can here add information from the Berliner Antikensammlung from back in 2005, though, that the inscription has actually been re-found).

Across the pages, two particularly interesting foci appear: first, the influence between Egyptian and Greco-Roman cults, and second, the clarification above all from the Egyptian material, that oracular dreams of the institutionalized and ritualized sort that present scholarship defines as incubation, is only a small piece of a larger religious perception of dreams as a medium for divine communication. Here, the question of definition becomes essential, both for the issue of whether Greek incubation originated in Mesopotamia, or whether

Byzantine incubation originated in the Greco-Roman habit. Maybe it is time to stop talking about one ritual of incubation, originating in Mesopotamia and spreading westwards. As the author claims that Early Christian incubation has a character of its own distinct from the Greco-Roman ritual (Appendix 16, as I have also previously argued in an article in the *Scandinavian Journal of Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies*), we need to address the question of definition of incubation. All humans dream and many societies create religions wherein dreams are given an importance in communication with the divine sphere. As incubation, if defined as to a certain degree institutionalized and ritualized communication with a deity in his or her thought dwelling place through a dream, shows a wealth of variation in the Mesopotamian, Anatolian, Egyptian and Greco-Roman cultures, we should start investigating this variation of oracular habit with a new range of questions apart from the one on continuity and influence. One of the

great merits of this book is that it analyses in depth every single testimonium of dream communication with the divine at a sacred place, never letting one unified argument bend the evidence in one way or the other. Necessarily the account then becomes disparate, with many appendices, which cannot be fitted within the book proper, but its many careful reflections on the de facto varying nature of incubation practices have a given place in any future work on the topic.

Reading the book generates a wish for further studies on incubation, and curiosity of the opinion of the author on important issues such as the cultic connection between oracular dreams and Chthonian gods, or possible chronological developments of the phenomenon within each of the separate cultures presented. To conclude, the book is a wonderful presentation and analysis of a vast material, providing a solid basis for further studies on Greco-Roman, as well as Egyptian, healing cults and divinatory techniques, not only incubation.

HEDVIG VON EHRENHEIM
Department of Archaeology and Ancient History
Uppsala University
Box 626
SE-751 26 Uppsala